



Report to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee

31st January 2018

Report of: Laraine Manley, Executive Director, Place

Subject: Western Road First World War Memorial Committee
Recommendations – Formal Cabinet Response

Author of Report: Philip Beecroft, Head of Highway Maintenance
Tel. 273 5911

Summary:

This report represents the Cabinet response to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee’s recommendations on Western Road First World War Memorial – the formal Cabinet response was delayed awaiting the outcome of further investigations commissioned in response to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee’s recommendations (see Cabinet 20th September and 13th December 2017).

Type of item: The report author should tick the appropriate box

Reviewing of existing policy	
Informing the development of new policy	
Statutory consultation	
Cabinet request for scrutiny	
Full Council request for scrutiny	
Cabinet response to Scrutiny Recommendation(s)	X
Call-in of Cabinet decision	
Briefing paper for the Scrutiny Committee	

The Scrutiny Committee is being asked to:

Note the Cabinet response to the Committee’s recommendations in regard to Western Road First World War Memorial

Background Papers:

War Memorial Trees Cabinet Report of 13th December 2017

Category of Report: OPEN

Report of the Director of Culture and Environment

Western Road First World War Memorial Committee Recommendations – Formal Cabinet Response

1. Introduction/Context

- 1.1 This report represents the Cabinet response to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee's recommendations on Western Road First World War Memorial – the formal Cabinet response was delayed awaiting the outcome of further investigations commissioned in response to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee's recommendations (see Cabinet 20th September and 13th December 2017).

<https://imgmeetings.sheffield.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=123&MId=6621&Ver=4> – 20th September 2017

<https://imgmeetings.sheffield.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=123&MId=6624&Ver=4> – 13th December 2017

2. Main body of report, matters for consideration, etc

- 2.1 The Chair of Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee presented the Committee's report and recommendations to Cabinet on 20th October 2017, where Cabinet resolved:

RESOLVED:

That Cabinet:-

- (a) thanks the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee for its work in relation to the Western Road First World War Memorial;
- (b) notes the Western Road First World War Memorial Report that is attached as Appendix A to the report;
- (c) notes that the Cabinet Member for Environment and Streetscene provided a verbal response to the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee's September 2017 meeting;
- (d) agrees that a written report on progress on actions in response to the recommendations be provided to the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee for October 2017;
- (e) agrees that the Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group report be shared with all members of Council, as requested by the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee; and
- (f) commissions Amey to carry out outline design work to identify solutions to retain as many highway trees on memorial streets as soon as possible to sufficient detail to enable an estimate of the additional funding needed to be provided to Cabinet.

- 2.2 Outcomes from the subsequent work on the subject and the Cabinet Report of 13th December 2017 – War Memorial Trees - (see Appendix to this report) in response to the recommendations of the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee are given below:

Scrutiny Recommendation 1
<i>We recommend that the Western Road war memorial, with its intrinsic avenue of trees, be considered differently to other street trees. That it should be seen as an exception to the norm, and every effort is made to retain as many existing trees where possible by all appropriate means available to the council, and that this recommendation does not extend to other types of war memorial.</i>
Cabinet/Executive Response
The council agreed with this proposal and commissioned officers to further investigate and report to Cabinet. This request was carried out and reported to Cabinet on 13 th December 2017 in a report titled 'War Memorial Trees'. Supplied as an appendix to this report.
Scrutiny Recommendation 2
<i>We recommend that beyond the core investment period, the council moves from a position of limited or no obvious maintenance, to a clear and stated proactive war memorial and tree management plan.</i>
Cabinet/Executive Response
In the Cabinet report the council committed to support the long term investment plan in the city's war memorial trees as set out in the report. Recommendation 5 of the Cabinet report, which was accepted, states 'The council guarantee that the 300 new trees in parks and any possible replacement trees on the war memorial streets, be replanted in perpetuity'. Para 2.1 of the 13 th December Cabinet report gives more detail and includes a statement about implementing this in discussion with residents.
Scrutiny Recommendation 3
<i>We recommend where practicable and affordable that engineering solutions are adopted to retain as many memorial trees on Western Road/Mona Avenue, as far as possible.</i>
Cabinet/Executive Response
Outlined in the Cabinet Report of 13 th December 2017 are the investigations

<p>and costings for carrying out engineering solutions to retain trees on Western Road. These are chiefly covered with respect to Western Road in section 6 of the Cabinet report.</p>
<p>Scrutiny Recommendation 4</p>
<p><i>We recommend that the Council look to restoring over time the Western Road War Memorial to its original concept. This would be subject to appropriate space, funding, and agreement with residents on Western Road and Mona Avenue.</i></p>
<p>Cabinet/Executive Response</p>
<p>The 13th December Cabinet report covered this request at Recommendation 4 as well as in more detail in paras 1.1 (c) and (f), 1.6 and 2.1. This approach will extend to all war memorial trees covered in the Cabinet report on Western Road/Mona Road, Tay Street, Oxford Street, Springvale Road, Binfield Road and Heathfield Road. These discussions are currently being planned.</p>
<p>Scrutiny Recommendation 5</p>
<p><i>We note and support the Council's commitment to 'replanting and rededicating memorials over the coming months'. In regard to Western Road this could be with a view to unveil a fitting memorial in time for Centenary Anniversary of Armistice Day November 2018.</i></p>
<p>Cabinet/Executive Response</p>
<p>This is confirmed in the 13th December Cabinet report at paras 1.1 (a) and (f).</p>
<p>Scrutiny Recommendation 6</p>
<p><i>We ask the relevant Cabinet member to share with the public the immediate, medium and longer term, future maintenance plan for Western Road War Memorial street trees.</i></p>
<p>Cabinet/Executive Response</p>
<p>Following the in depth investigations that appeared in the Scrutiny report and further incorporated into the 13th December Cabinet report, options to retain the trees on Western Road were considered and priced. Recommendation 2 and Section 6 paras 6.1, 6.2 and 6.4 – 6.8.</p>
<p>Scrutiny Recommendation 7</p>
<p><i>We recommend that the relevant Cabinet Member comes to the Economic and Environmental Scrutiny Committee to explain how they will respond to the differences and challenges identified in a) the Council's technical recommendations following the Independent Tree Panel report, and b), the</i></p>

technical submissions from the community; and also the ask for a technical dialogue between the community and Streets Ahead.

Cabinet/Executive Response

Cllr Bryan Lodge, Cabinet Member Environment and Streetscene attended Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee on 13th September 2017 and give an initial response to the recommendations and questions from the Committee;

- Councillor Lodge stressed that no decisions had been made in respect of the Western Road First World War memorial trees at this time, and that any such decisions would be made by the Cabinet, at its meeting to be held on 20th September 2017. That meeting requested further work to be done on engineering solutions and costings and led to the Cabinet report of 13th December 2017.
- Councillor Lodge stated that it was important that the views of all residents were considered, on the basis that the Council had received complaints from some residents with regard to damage being caused to their properties by the tree roots.
- Councillor Lodge said that to determine the final decisions on Western Road there was still a need to understand what costs were required in connection with any engineering works required. There may then be a need to identify additional funding to be put towards such alternative solutions. It was likely that objections would be received from some residents in terms of build outs and other required highway improvements. There were likely to be additional costs involved with regard to such improvements, with regard to loss of parking and residents having difficulty accessing driveways.
- Cabinet would in due course make the decisions based on all the information available with regard to the differences and challenges identified in the council's technical recommendations as well as any cost implications.
- Councillor Lodge also expressed a view that the proposed replacements are a repeat of the process carried out decades ago when some of the trees were replaced. The current proposals and commitment to maintain or replace the war memorial trees in perpetuity will ensure the memorial and the trees will be there for future generations to respect and enjoy.

3 What does this mean for the people of Sheffield?

- 3.1 The council has committed to replant all memorial trees that need replacement and to do this in perpetuity, alongside consultation with residents on options to replant lost memorial trees that were never replaced. Over the years, around half the original trees have been lost and not replaced. We will work with the people of Sheffield on what they would like to see from this new

major memorial project and how the city should best commemorate those who have fallen in conflicts but who are not represented by the many existing memorial trees in the city. We will work collaboratively with the people of Sheffield, community groups, The Greenspaces Forum, the Royal British Legion and the War Memorials Trust on this new memorial project.

- 3.2 For first time in 100 years, and in readiness for the 2018 Centenary we will create a new memorial consisting of around 300 trees in our city's parks and will retain this new memorial in perpetuity. This project will be led by the Parks and Countryside Service and will be in addition to any work on memorial street trees carried out by Streets Ahead.

4. Recommendation

- 4.1 That the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee note the formal Cabinet response to the Committee's recommendations in regard to Western Road First World War Memorial